



City of Bexley, OH

01/26/2021

BZAP-20-48

*(BZAP)Board of Zoning & Planning Application - Review of Variance requests for Residential and Commercial Development

Status: Active

Date Created: Dec 18, 2020

Applicant

Nicole Boyer
nicole.boyer@tcbinc.org
736 Oak Street
Columbus, Oh 43205
380-235-8345

Location

2300 E LIVINGSTON AV
Bexley, OH

Owner:

Sally A Woodyard
2300 E Livingston Avenue, , Bexley, OH 43209

A.1: Project Information

Brief Project Description - ALSO PROVIDE 2 HARD COPIES OF PLANS TO THE BUILDING DEPARTMENT.

Bexley Apartments at 2300 E Livingston includes a proposed, three-story, multi-family building located on 0.74-ac of land. The building includes twenty-seven (27) apartment units (a combination of one, two and three bedroom units). The building is placed on the site to front both E Livingston Avenue and Francis Avenue with a proposed thirty-space parking lot to the rear. Parking lot access will be from one curb cut on Francis Avenue. Landscaping and fencing will be provided to comply with the code requirements. The existing building and parking will be demolished.

Architecture Review



Conditional Use



Demolition



Planned Unit Dev



Rezoning



Variance or Special Permit



What requires Major Architectural Review

Proposed new construction, three-story, multi-family building.

What requires Minor Architectural Review

new building

Major Architectural Review

Minor Architectural Review

A.1: Attorney / Agent Information

Agent Name

Not Applicable

Agent Address

--

Agent Email

--

Agent Phone

--

Property Owner Name

--

Property Owner Email

--

Property Owner Address

--

Property Owner Phone number

--

A.2: Fee Worksheet

Estimated Valuation of Project

4000000

Minor Architectural Review

Major Architectural Review

Variance Review

Variance Review Type

--

Zoning

Zoning Review Type

Conditional Use request

Sign Review and Architectural Review for Commercial Projects

Review Type

Special Permit, Conditional Uses and All Others

Appeal of ARB decision to BZAP

Appeal of BZAP decision to City Council

Conditional Use - Explain type of Use if being requested and fill out Conditional Use Criteria

Bexley Apartments is a multi-family building and the project will request variances for apartment units including 1) Dwelling units on the first floor and 2) dwelling units above the first floor.

Detailed explanation of appeal

With the exception of the use, the building will comply with the height, yard, and landscape requirements. Therefore, we believe the proposed building is consistent with the goals of the City and do not anticipate the proposed building having a negative impact on the surrounding neighborhood. The proposed apartment building will be a transition between the primarily residential nature of E Livingston to the east and the existing commercial to the west. The traffic impact will be minor considering the building only includes twenty-seven (27) units and thirty (30) parking spaces. The project includes one curb cut off of Francis Avenue.

B: Project Worksheet: Property Information

Occupancy Type	Zoning District
Residential	CS
Use Classification	Other Classification
Other	--

B: Project Worksheet: Lot Info

Width (ft)	Depth (ft)
214	148
Total Area (SF)	
32250	

B: Project Worksheet: Primary Structure Info

Existing Footprint (SF)	Proposed Addition (SF)
5435	--
Removing (SF)	Type of Structure
5435	Wood Frame and Masonry
Proposed New Primary Structure or Residence (SF)	
34687	
Total (footprint) square foot of all structures combined	
11663	

B: Project Worksheet: Garage and/or Accessory Structure Info (Incl. Decks, Pergolas, Etc)

Existing Footprint (SF)	Proposed Addition (SF)
--	--

New Structure Type

--

Ridge Height

--

Proposed New Structure (SF)

--

Is there a 2nd Floor

--

Total of all garage and accessory structures (SF)

--

Total building lot coverage (SF)

--

Total building lot coverage (% of lot)

--

Is this replacing an existing garage and/or accessory structure?

--

B: Project Worksheet: Hardscape

Existing Driveway (SF)

--

Existing Patio (SF)

--

Existing Private Sidewalk (SF)

--

Proposed Additional Hardscape (SF)

--

Total Hardscape (SF)

11708

B: Project Worksheet: Total Coverage

Total overall lot coverage (SF)

23371

Total overall lot coverage (% of lot)

72

C.1 Architectural Review Worksheet: Roofing

Roofing

Structure

House or Principal Structure

Existing Roof Type

--

New Roof Type

TPO Rubber

New Single Manufacturer

TBD

New Roof Style and Color

Low-slope ('flat') roof, white membrane.
Standing seam metal roofing at accent areas

C.1 Architectural Review Worksheet: Windows

Windows



Existing Window Type

--

New Window Manufacturer

Vinyl window mfr. TBD

Structure

House or Principal Structure

Existing Window Materials

--

New Window Style/Mat./Color

Casement and Fixed Windows. Energy Efficient with Low-E glass.

C.1 Architectural Review Worksheet: Doors

Doors



Existing Entrance Door Type

--

Door Finish

Painted

Proposed Door Style

Full glass alum. doors at primary entrances, flush solid doors at service areas and stair exit

Structure

House or Principal Structure

Existing Garage Door Type

--

Proposed Door Type

Aluminum Storefront at main entrances, insulated hollow-metal at secondary entrances.

Proposed Door Color

TBD

C.1 Architectural Review Worksheet: Exterior Trim

Exterior Trim



Proposed New Door Trim

Aluminum

Proposed New Window Trim

Smooth face PVC trim or fiber cement trim

Do the proposed changes affect the overhangs?

--

Existing Door Trim

--

Existing Window Trim

--

Trim Color(s)

TBD

C.2 Architectural Review Worksheet: Exterior Wall Finishes

Exterior Wall Finishes



Existing Finishes

--

Existing Finishes Manufacturer, Style, Color

--

Proposed Finishes

Other

Other Proposed Finishes

--

Proposed Finishes Manufacturer, Style, Color

Horizontal and vertical siding, fiber cement panel accents, and brick veneer

By checking the following box I agree (as the applicant of record) to monitor this application and respond to any additional information requested by the Zoning Officer, Design Consultant, and Bldg. Dept Staff, through the email in this application, in order to allow a notice to be written and sent out 2 weeks prior to the next scheduled meeting and to be placed on the Agenda. This includes the ARB meeting when Design Recommendation is needed prior to Board of Zoning and Planning Review. I understand that incomplete applications may be withheld from the agenda or only offered informal review.



D: Tree & Public Gardens Commission Worksheet

Type of Landscape Project

City Right-of-Way Landscape

Landscape Architect/Designer

POD Design, Todd Foley

Architect/Designer Phone

RDL Architects, Margaret Kavourias, 216-752-4300

Architect/Designer E-mail

margaret@rdlarchitects.com

Project Description

The project is seeking approval for the conceptual landscaping plan with this BZAP application and will provide a fully developed landscape plan in the fall of 2021 for view and approval. It is the goal of the project team to provide a streetscaping plan that aligns with the City's larger goals to improve the tree canopy and pedestrian feel of the community. The proposed project will provide new landscaping and hardscaping throughout the site. New trees will be planted along East Livingston and Francis and the building will benefit from foundation plantings and hardscaping to provide a more residential feel that complements the adjacent residential uses. The full landscaping scope of work will be completed with the construction of the new building and will be delivered in 2023.

I have read and understand the above criteria



D: (Staff Only) Tree & Public Gardens Commission Worksheet

Design plan with elevations (electronic copy as specified in instructions plus 1 hard copy)

Design Specifications as required in item 3 in "Review Guidelines and List of Criteria" above

Applicant has been advised that Landscape Designer/Architect must be present at meeting

E.1 Variance Worksheet

Description of the Proposed Variance. Please provide a thorough description of the variance being sought and the reason why.

--

1. Does the property in question require a variance in order to yield a reasonable return? Can there be any beneficial use of the property without the variance? Please describe.

--

2. Is the variance substantial? Please describe.

--

3. Would the essential character of the neighborhood be substantially altered or would adjoining properties suffer a substantial detriment as a result of the variance? Please describe.

--

E.2 Variance Worksheet

4. Would the variance adversely affect the delivery of governmental services (e.g. water, sewer, garbage)? Please describe.

--

5. Did the property owner purchase the property with the knowledge of zoning restriction? Please describe.

--

6. Can the property owner's predicament feasibly be obviated through some method other than a variance? Please describe.

--

7. Is the spirit and intent behind the zoning requirement observed and is substantial justice done by granting the variance? Please describe.

--

F.1 Fence Variance Worksheet

Lot Type

--

Narrative description of how you plan to meet the pertinent outlined variance criteria

--

F.1-F.2 Fence Variance Worksheet: Side and Rear Yard Restrictions for Corner Lots

1. Compatibility: Describe how the proposed side yard fence or wall exceeding forty-eight inches in height and on the street side of a corner lot compatible with other properties in the neighborhood?

--

2. Height: Please verify that the maximum height of such fence or wall shall not exceed seventy-two inches as measured from the average grade, as defined in Section 1230.06. Artificially raising the height of the lot line by the use of mounding, retaining walls or similar means shall be included within the seventy-two inch maximum height.

--

3. Transparency: Fences exceeding forty-eight inches in height should include transparency in the upper 12” to 18” of the fence through the use of latticework, pickets, or other appropriate design elements. Describe how you have satisfied this requirement.

--

4. Screening: A landscaping plan must be filed with the application for a special permit, indicating how such fencing or wall is to be screened from the street side elevation. The landscape plan should be designed in such a way as to mitigate the impact of a solid fence or wall as it relates to the street and other properties. Describe how the landscape plan addresses these items.

--

5. Visibility and Safety: The installation of such fence or wall shall not create a visibility or safety concern for vehicular and/or pedestrian movement. Please describe any visibility/safety concerns with your design.

--

6. Material Compatibility: No chain link, wire mesh or other similar material shall be installed on lot lines adjacent to public rights-of-way. Please verify that your design complies with this requirement.

--

7. Finished Side: Any fence or wall erected on a lot located at the intersection of two or more streets must have the finished and not the structural side facing the adjacent property, alley or street. Please verify that your design complies with this requirement.

--

F.3 Fence Variance Worksheet

Front Yard Restrictions

Fences Adjacent to Commercial Districts

Require Commercial Fences Adjacent to Residential Districts



F.3 Fence Variance Worksheet: Front Yard Restrictions

The proposed decorative landscape wall or fence is compatible with other properties in the neighborhood.

--

The height of the fence or wall does not exceed the size permitted as above when measured from the average grade of the yard where the fence or wall is to be installed. Artificially raising the height of the lot line by the use of mounding, retaining walls or similar means shall be included in the maximum height.

--

Posts, columns and finials may extend up to 6" above the maximum allowed height of the fence panels.
CHAPTER 1264. FENCES AND WALLS City of Bexley Zoning Ordinance

--

A landscaping plan shall be filed with the application indicating how such fencing and/ or wall is to be integrated with existing front yard landscaping.

--

The installation of such fence and/or wall shall not create a visibility or safety concern for vehicular and/or pedestrian movement.

--

No chain link, wire mesh, concrete block or other similar type material shall be installed as a decorative landscape wall or fence.

--

The fence and/or wall shall have a minimum of 50% transparency.

--

That the lot exhibits unique characteristics that support the increase in fence height.

--

G. Demolition Worksheet

Is your property historically significant? Please attached supporting documentation. Recomendated sources include ownership records, a letter from the Bexley Historical Society, etc.

No

Is your property architecturally significant? Please attached supporting documentation. Recomendated sources include a letter of opinion from an architect or expert with historical preservation expertise.

No

If you answered "yes" to either of the above two questions, please describe any economic hardship that results from being unable to demolish the primary residence, and attach any supporting evidence.

--

If you answered "yes" to either of the above two questions, please describe any other unusual or compelling circumstances that require the demolition of the primary residence, and attach any supporting evidence.

--

I will provide a definite plan for reuse of the site, including proposed replacement structures, by completing Worksheets B & C and any other pertinent worksheets, along with required exhibits.

Provide a narrative time schedule for the replacement project

The project is seeking zoning approval for the conditional use of residential units on the property in order to pursue financing. Should the project successfully secure the necessary financing the team will be submitting a fully developed Demolition Worksheet sheet in fall of 2021 along with the full ARB and Landscaping submissions. Construction activities will commence in summer 2022, and it is anticipated that construction will last for 12-months.

Please provide a narrative of what impact the proposed replacement project will have on the subject property and the neighborhood.

We believe the proposed building is consistent with the goals of the City and do not anticipate the proposed building having a negative impact on the surrounding neighborhood. The apartment building will be a transition between the primarily residential nature of E Livingston to the east and the existing commercial to the west. The traffic impact will be minor considering the building only includes twenty-seven (27) units and thirty (30) parking spaces. The project includes one curb cut off of Francis Avenue.

I: Conditional Use Worksheet

The use is consistent with the goals and policies of any adopted plans of the City of Bexley, including, but not limited to, the Main Street Guidelines.

Yes

The use will not have a negative impact on the neighboring land uses and the larger community because of the differences between the proposed use and existing uses in the community.

Yes

The use will not be hazardous to or have a negative impact on existing or future surrounding uses.

Yes

The use meets or satisfies the lot/yard or height requirements in the code and other general code provisions including landscape requirements, parking standards, and storm drainage requirements as existing or as may be adopted.

Yes

The use does not create an undue burden on existing public facilities and services such as street, utilities, school or refuse disposal.

Yes

The use is consistent with and/or furthers the City's economic goals and will not decrease property values or have a negative economic impact.

Yes

The use is in character and keeping and compatible with the adjacent structures and uses.

Yes

Any proposed construction will not result in the destruction, loss, or damage of a natural, scenic, or historic feature of major importance. Yes

Yes

Please provide a narrative for how you meet the above criteria.

The project consists of a 3-story, 34,687 square-foot residential building on approximately 0.74 acres at the northwest corner of East Livingston and Francis Avenue. The site is currently zoned Commercial Service District ("CS"). Applicant is seeking approval for a conditional use to construct 27 rental apartment units on the site. The project will bring new housing options to the Bexley community, helping to further the City's goals of creating and preserving mixed-income housing in Bexley.

The property provides a strong transition point from the predominantly commercial uses to the west and south to the residential uses to the north and east. The proposed construction will include the demolition of the two existing structures fronting East Livingston Avenue, neither of which is a historic feature of major importance. The proposed 3-story residential building engages the Livingston corridor, with off-street parking tucked behind the building. But for the conditional use request for the residential dwellings, the project meets all zoning requirements of a CS District and will meet City of Bexley requirements for perimeter screening and landscaping as well as storm water requirements. The architectural style of the building complements the Mid-Century and traditional homes while also pulling vertical and horizontal lines from the commercial business district to the west.

The proposed project will not create any additional burdens to the existing public infrastructure. The site is currently developed as a commercial use and the proposed residential use will take advantage of existing water and sewer connections where practical and feasible. The site has been designed to maximize off-street parking at a ratio of 1.11 spaces per unit, exceeding residential parking requirements for similar MUC zoning districts. The newly constructed apartments are predominantly one- and two- bedroom units for smaller households and will not create a burden on Bexley Schools. These units are, in part, replacement housing for affordable apartments lost in the Ferndale-Mayfield area due to environmental contamination.

The proposed development will not have a negative impact on the property values or the overall community economic development initiatives. The mixed-income development will enhance the Livingston Ave corridor and create high-quality new rental housing options for Bexley's essential community workforce (teachers, librarians, police, fire, service industry).

J: Home Occupation Worksheet

Business Name

--

Business Description

--

No person other than members of the family residing on the premises shall be engaged in such occupation.

--

The use of the dwelling unit for the home occupation shall be clearly incidental and subordinate to its use for residential purposes by its occupants, and not more than twenty-five percent of the floor area of the dwelling unit shall be used in the conduct of the home occupation.

--

There shall be no change in the outside appearance of the building or premises, or other visible or nuisance evidence of the conduct of such home occupation.

--

There shall be no sales in connection with a home occupation.

--

No traffic shall be generated by a home occupation in greater volume than would normally be expected in a residential neighborhood.

--




Any need for parking generated by the conduct of a home occupation shall be met off the street and other than in a required front yard. The off-street parking spaces required for the home occupation shall be maintained in addition to the space or spaces required for the residence itself.

--

Please provide a narrative for how you meet the above criteria.

Not applicable.

Attachments

-  20163_2021-01-07 Livingston Elevations.pdf
Uploaded by Nicole Boyer on Jan 07, 2021 4:53 PM
-  20163_2021-01-07 Livingston Plans.pdf
Uploaded by Nicole Boyer on Jan 07, 2021 4:53 PM
-  2021-01-06_Livingston Landscape-updated.pdf
Uploaded by Nicole Boyer on Jan 07, 2021 4:54 PM



North side of Livingston 3.jpg
Uploaded by Nicole Boyer on Dec 17, 2020 3:25 PM

 20163_2021-01-07 Livingston Site.pdf
Uploaded by Nicole Boyer on Jan 07, 2021 4:54 PM



 Bexley Apartments_Project Summary.pdf

Uploaded by Nicole Boyer on Jan 07, 2021 1:53 PM

 20163_2021-01-07 Livingston Context & Matls.pdf

Uploaded by Nicole Boyer on Jan 07, 2021 4:55 PM

History

Date	Activity
Nov 30 2020 1:55 pm	Nicole Boyer started a draft of Record BZAP-20-48
Dec 14 2020 9:54 pm	Nicole Boyer altered Record BZAP-20-48, changed ownerName from "" to ""
Dec 14 2020 9:56 pm	Nicole Boyer altered Record BZAP-20-48, changed ownerCity from "" to "Bexley"
Dec 14 2020 9:56 pm	Nicole Boyer altered Record BZAP-20-48, changed ownerEmail from "" to ""
Dec 14 2020 9:56 pm	Nicole Boyer altered Record BZAP-20-48, changed ownerName from "" to "Sally A Woodyard"
Dec 14 2020 9:56 pm	Nicole Boyer altered Record BZAP-20-48, changed ownerPhoneNo from "" to ""
Dec 14 2020 9:56 pm	Nicole Boyer altered Record BZAP-20-48, changed ownerPostalCode from "" to "43209"
Dec 14 2020 9:56 pm	Nicole Boyer altered Record BZAP-20-48, changed ownerState from "" to "OH"
Dec 14 2020 9:56 pm	Nicole Boyer altered Record BZAP-20-48, changed ownerStreetName from "" to "E Livingston Avenue"
Dec 14 2020 9:56 pm	Nicole Boyer altered Record BZAP-20-48, changed ownerStreetNo from "" to "2300"
Dec 14 2020 9:56 pm	Nicole Boyer altered Record BZAP-20-48, changed ownerUnit from "" to ""
Dec 17 2020 8:26 pm	Nicole Boyer submitted Record BZAP-20-48
Dec 17 2020 8:26 pm	approval step Zoning Officer was assigned to Kathy Rose on Record BZAP-20-48
Dec 18 2020 6:58 pm	Kathy Rose submitted Record BZAP-20-48
Jan 07 2021 6:15 pm	Nicole Boyer added attachment Bexley Apartments_Project Summary.pdf to Record BZAP-20-48
Jan 07 2021 9:55 pm	Nicole Boyer added attachment 20163_2021-01-07 Livingston Context & Matls.pdf to Record BZAP-20-48
Jan 26 2021 7:33 pm	Kathy Rose approved approval step Zoning Officer on Record BZAP-20-48
Jan 26 2021 7:33 pm	Kathy Rose assigned approval step Design Planning Consultant to Karen Bokor on Record BZAP-20-48